

Application No.: «AppNumber»

Case No.: «CaseNumber»

**REMARKS**

This is in response to the Examiner's action mailed September 6, 2005. In that action, the Examiner rejected claims 1 through 26, all of the claims pending in the present application. The applicants respectfully disagree that the claims pending in the present application are properly rejectable.

The Examiner has rejected claims 1 through 11 and 13 through 22 under 35 U.S.C. §102(b) as anticipated by United States patent 5,468,540. The applicants respectfully disagree that the Lu patent anticipates the present claims.

The Examiner asserts that the Lu patent "discloses a composite article having large scale dimensional stability," without any basis for this assertion. In fact, as that phrase is defined in the present specification, it requires that the article may be heated to a temperature of 150° C and held at that temperature for up to sixty minutes and then returned to ambient temperatures while still retaining its dimensional stability. The only material taught or suggested by Lu for use in a film is polyvinyl chloride (PVC). Since PVC has a glass transition temperature ( $T_g$ ) of about 78° C, it clearly will not be dimensionally stable when heated to 150° C.

The Examiner has rejected claims 12 and 23 through 26 under 35 U.S.C. §103(a) as obvious in view of the Lu patent. The Examiner argues that, although the Lu reference does not teach all of the limitations of these claims, the elements added would be discovered by routine experimentation. However, since the Lu patent does not teach the required dimensional stability as required by all of the currently pending claims, the Examiner's assertion fails.


In view of these comments, the applicants respectfully request that the Examiner reconsider the present rejection of the claims and allow all claims pending in this application.

Respectfully submitted,

12-16-2005

Date

By:

  
Stephen W. Buckingham, Reg. No.: 30,035  
Telephone No.: 651-733-3379

Office of Intellectual Property Counsel  
3M Innovative Properties Company  
Facsimile No.: 651-736-3833